

**CHELAN COUNTY**

**DEPARTMENT OF HEARING EXAMINER**

316 WASHINGTON STREET, SUITE 301  
WENATCHEE, WASHINGTON 98801

**BEFORE THE CHELAN COUNTY HEARING EXAMINER**

|                          |   |                                   |
|--------------------------|---|-----------------------------------|
| <b>IN THE MATTER OF:</b> | ) | <b>FINDINGS OF FACT,</b>          |
| AA 23-055                | ) | <b>CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND</b>     |
| Judy                     | ) | <b>DECISION ON ADMINISTRATIVE</b> |
|                          | ) | <b>APPEAL</b>                     |

**I. FINDINGS OF FACT**

1. A request for an Administrative Appeal was submitted to appeal the denial of a renewal extension request for a short-term rental.
2. The Owners/Appellants are Mark D. and Terri A. Judy.
3. The project location is 12081 BRETZ DR., PLAIN, WA 98826. The legal description is WENATCHEE RIVER PARK LOT 16 0.7400 ACRES. The Parcel Number is 26-17-12-930-160. The zoning district is RURAL WATERFRONT (RW).
4. The subject property was permitted for 2021/2022 as a short term rental.
5. The Applicant submitted a Short-Term Rental Renewal Application dated September 16, 2022, which was within the renewal deadline of October 31, 2022, to continue use as a short-term rental. The Applicant was denied the permit renewal as they did not meet the renewal application criteria.
6. The Applicants had not submitted required proof of signage within the deadline to be eligible for renewal.
7. Per Chelan County Code 11.88.290 (2)(E)(i)(c)- That the short-term rental meets all requirements of subsection (3) of this section within one year of the effective date of the ordinance codified in this section; provided, that legally required health and safety provisions within subsection (3) of this section including garbage, consumer safety, fire safety and outdoor burning, and property management plan communications provisions are met within ninety days of the effective date of the ordinance codified in this section, except that in the Manson urban growth area, all provisions consistent with Section 11.23.040 as it existed on August 25, 2020, shall be met on the effective date of the ordinance codified in this section.
8. Per Chelan County Code 11.88.290(3)(G)- Signs:

8.1 (i) All owners or operators must display and maintain the address of the residence so that it is clearly visible from the street or access road in compliance with Section 10.20.520 requirements. The rental must also display and maintain an additional sign outside identifying the property as short-term rental and displaying the Chelan County short-term rental registration number and central phone number required by the county. The sign must not exceed eight square feet in area and if illuminated, must be indirectly illuminated, and letters and numbers must at a minimum four inches in height.

8.2 (ii) Placement of the Sign.

8.2.1 (a) For short-term rental structures located fifty feet or less from the primary road, the sign text shall be displayed on the side of the structure facing the road and shall be visible from the road designated in the assigned address.

8.2.2 (b) For short-term rental structures located fifty feet or more from the primary road, or for buildings not visible from the road, the sign text shall be posted inside the owner's property line at the access point to the road designated in the assigned address.

8.3 (iii) If the permanent contact information changes during the permit period, the new information must be changed on the sign. Renewal applications must provide evidence of the sign.

8.4 (iv) The director may allow annual mailings to adjacent properties and an interior posted notice for tenants in lieu of an exterior sign where a property's size and visibility make an exterior sign ineffective, or if for reason of improving security. The owner shall provide verification of mailings and a copy of the notice with the annual permit renewal.

9. Pursuant to CCC 11.28.290(4)(J)(i), to receive approval or renewal of a short term permit the "owner must demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Director that all approval criteria listed below have been satisfied . . . (c) the short term rental is consistent with the short term rental standards of this section."

10. A part of the approval criteria is proof within the renewal application, that there is proper signage at the short term rental.

11. On May 18, 2022, the Applicant was sent their final STR permit for 2022, it included information on the required signage.

12. The Applicant returned a signed copy of the 2022 finalized permit dated July 22, 2022.

13. On November 16, 2022, Community Development staff emailed the Applicant informing them their renewal could not be processed without proof of sign.

14. There was no response from the Applicant.

15. On January 13, 2023, Community Development staff emailed the Applicant the denial of their renewal application. The email included that a hard copy of the documents would also be mailed via USPS.

16. On January 27, 2023, the administrative appeal (AA-23-055) was filed with Chelan County Community Development by the Applicant. The Applicant instructed Community Development staff to use the \$500 check they had sent for renewal fees toward the appeal fees then they paid the balance via credit card.
17. On January 28, 2023, Community Development staff received an email from the Applicant with photo of sign.
18. On January 30, 2023, Community Development staff emailed the Fire Inspector as the Applicant stated they thought they had sent a photo of the sign at the same time they sent in their fire inspection corrections. Fire Inspector Osburn responded that he had searched for such an email and found none.
19. Community Development followed the short-term rental code (11.88.290) and decisions made hold all applicants to the same consistent standard. On page two of the short-term rental application (both new and renewal), the applicant initialed the acknowledgements and signed at the bottom under the statement, "I certify (or declare) under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Washington that the foregoing is true, correct, and complete." Of those, The eighth acknowledgement states, "I shall, as designated in CCC 11.88.290 (3)(G), display and maintain the address of the residence so that it is clearly visible from the street or access road in compliance with Section 10.20.520 requirements. The rental must also display and maintain an additional sign outside identifying the property as short-term rental and displaying the Chelan County short-term rental registration number and contact phone number required by the county. The sign must not exceed eight square feet in area and if illuminated, must be indirectly illuminated, and letters and numbers must at a minimum four inches in height.  
The twelfth acknowledgement states, "I certify that I am the property owner, or authorized agent of the property owner, and I have familiarized myself the rules and regulations of Chelan County with respect to making this application."  
The fifteenth acknowledgement states- "I acknowledge and agree that my short-term rental permit expires each year on December 31 and that I am required to apply for renewal no later than October 31 of the preceding year." After due legal notice, an open record public hearing was held via Zoom video conference on April 4, 2023.
20. Admitted into the record were the following:
  - 20.1 Ex. A Denial of permit application renewal extension for Short-Term Rental dated January 12, 2023.
  - 20.2 Ex. B AA 23-055 Application Materials
  - 20.3 Ex. C 2023 renewal application received from Applicant
  - 20.4 Ex. D May 18, 2022 email from Staff to Applicant with 2022 finalized STR permit
  - 20.4 Ex. E November 16, 2022 email from Staff to Applicant
  - 20.6 Ex. F January 28, 2023 email from Applicant to Staff with photo of sign
  - 20.7 Ex. G January 30-31, 2023 emails between Staff and Fire Inspector which had the August 2, 2022 email from Applicant attached
  - 20.8 Ex. H Staff Report.
21. Appearing and testifying at the hearing on behalf of the Appellant was Jeff Judy. Mr. Judy represents the property owner which is the estate of his late father. Mr. Judy's father died last week. He stated that the property is the primary residence for his mom and late father and that they only rent it when they are not living at the property. He stated that while they had a sign

for the STR, it was only put up when the property was being used as an STR. He indicated that he found the notification letter from the County regarding the deficiencies in the renewal application unopened on his father's desk.

- 22 Any Conclusion of Law that is more correctly a Finding of Fact is incorporated herein as such by this reference.

## II. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. The Hearing Examiner has been granted authority to render this Decision.
2. Chelan County Code Section 14.12.010: Administrative appeals:
  - (1) An administrative appeal to the hearing examiner shall be filed with the department within ten working days of the issuance of the decision appealed, together with the applicable appeal fee.
  - (2) The notice of appeal shall contain a concise statement identifying:
    - (A) The decision being appealed; (B) The name and address of the appellant and his/her interest(s) in the application or proposed development; (C) The specific reasons why the appellant believes the decision to be erroneous, including identification of each finding of fact, each conclusion, and each condition or action ordered which the appellant alleges is erroneous. The appellant shall have the burden of proving the decision is erroneous; (D) The specific relief sought by the appellant; (E) The appeal fee.
3. By not submitting a renewal application with all the required information, the Applicant failed to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Director that all approval criteria had been satisfied.
4. Any Finding of Fact that is more correctly a Conclusion of Law is incorporated herein as such by this reference.

## III. DECISION

WHEREFORE, based upon the above Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, the Hearing Examiner finds that the denial dated January 12, 2023 is hereby **AFFIRMED** based on the fact the Applicant did not meet the renewal application criteria.

Dated this 10 day of April, 2023.

CHELAN COUNTY HEARING EXAMINER

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Andrew L. Kottkamp

**This decision is subject to appeal pursuant to the Chelan County Code. Appeals must be timely filed. Anyone considering an appeal of this decision should seek immediate legal advice.**